

January 23, 2007

Mr. Himes conducted the meeting and called the meeting of the Tipp City Restoration and Architectural Board of Review to order on Tuesday, January 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2007 at 7:33 p.m. Other Board members in attendance included: Sadie Gaster, Janine Wert, Doug Lohnes, Adam Blake and Joe Bagi. Also in attendance were Assistant City Manager Bradley Vath and Board Secretary Kimberly Patterson.

Citizens signing the register: Robert and Katherine Zimmerman.

#### Oath of Office for New Board Members

Mayor George Lovett swore in Mr. Bagi and Mr. Blake.

#### Elections

Mrs. Wert **moved to open the floor for nominations**, seconded by Mr. Blake. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Wert, Blake, Bagi, Lohnes, Gaster, and Himes. Nays: None.

Mr. Lohnes **moved to nominate Mr. Himes for Board Chairman**, seconded by Mrs. Wert. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Lohnes, Wert, Blake, Bagi, and Gaster. Nays: None. Mr. Himes abstained from the vote.

Mrs. Wert **moved to nominate Mr. Lohnes for Vice Chairman**, seconded by Mrs. Gaster. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Wert, Gaster, Himes, Blake, and Bagi. Nays: None. Mr. Lohnes abstained from the vote.

Mrs. Wert **moved to close the floor for nominations**, seconded by Mrs. Gaster. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Wert, Gaster, Lohnes, Himes, Blake and Bagi. Nays: None.

#### Absence

Mrs. Wert **moved to excuse Mr. Kidwell from the meeting**, seconded by Mr. Lohnes. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Wert, Lohnes, Bagi, Blake, Gaster, and Himes. Nays: None.

#### Minutes

Chairman Himes asked for discussion. Mr. Lohnes **moved to approve the November 28, 2006, meeting minutes as written**, seconded by Mrs. Wert. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Lohnes, Wert, and Gaster. Mr. Bagi voted yes, even though he was not present at the meeting. Nays: None. Mr. Blake and Mr. Himes abstained from the vote.

#### Citizens Comments Not on the Agenda

There was none.

Chairman Himes explained the guidelines and procedures for the meeting. He noted that once the Board made a decision the applicant/interested party had 10 days to file an appeal to the Board of Zoning Appeals. After the 10-day waiting period had expired, the applicant may file for the appropriate permits.

January 23, 2007

New Business

**A. Robert Zimmerman - 131 E. Dow Street, Tipp City - Lot: Pt. IL 48** - The applicant requested Restoration Board approval for the replacement of the existing roofing with new shingles, maintenance and repair of the roof structure including removal of the existing aluminum roof vents, removal of the existing aluminum window frames, and the painting of the exterior structure. **Present zoning district:** CC/RA- Community Center/Old Tippecanoe City Restoration and Historic District Section(s): §154.052(I)

Mr. Vath stated that the applicant requested Restoration Board approval for the following items for the structure located at 131 E. Dow Street.

- Tear off three layers of existing shingle roofing and replace with CertainTeed asphalt shingles. Type: "Carriage House Shingle" Color: "Colonial Slate"
- Maintenance and repair of the roof structure including removal of the existing aluminum roof vents.
- Removal of existing aluminum window frames
- Painting of the primary structure with the following colors:
  - Main Building – "Ocean Storm"
  - Doors – Red
  - Trim – Cream
  - Sash – Red
  - Other – Cream

The applicant stated in the application material that the proposed roofing would be similar to roofing already existing in the Historic District and/or building in the vicinity. The applicant had also indicated that the painting scheme would be similar to the Old Municipal Building located at Third and Main Streets.

The following Guideline Booklet information was included in the packets received by the Board Members, Mr. Vath did not read out loud.

Guidelines Booklet – Exterior Paint Color pp. 20-22

*Paint colors varied through history, not only with fashions, but also because of available materials. Wherever possible, paint colors appropriate to the style and period of the particular building should be used. Ideally, paint color research should be conducted on your building to determine the original color. Building color has a greater visual impact than any other exterior architectural feature. This refers not only to exterior paint, but also to roof colors and colors for such items as window sashes, doors, and ornamentation.*

*Choice of color is a matter of personal preference. In the case of historic buildings, however, certain colors are more appropriate to a building's forms, style and setting than others. A balance must be struck between existing use of colors, the desires of property owners to use various colors and the limitation of color use. The end result of a project involving color choice should be compatible with the area's character*



January 23, 2007

and with colors used in nearby buildings.

Generally, on buildings constructed after 1870, when Italianate Commercial architecture came into full bloom, colors were noticeably darker, as greens, dark reds, oranges and olives began to creep into the palette. Trim was always in a darker color that complimented the lighter main body color, although this was sometimes reversed. Brackets, the most common decorative feature in this period, were usually painted the same color as the cornice.

At the end of the 19th century, more highly ornamented building surfaces presented the opportunity for more lively and imaginative use of color. Examples might be dark green or maroon trim with lighter body colors, such as pale yellow or light green. Earth colors, such as browns and brown-reds, would also be appropriate for trim colors, with beige body colors. Often two or three colors were combined in a single building.

After 1900 (post-Victorian and Colonial Revival), architecture generally began moving away from the complexity and heavy ornamentation of the late 19th century, and color followed suit. There was a shift from overbearing architecture to the plainer, simpler, classical forms of the past, with an accompanying return to lighter, cooler colors such as cream, yellow and white for buildings.

After the turn of the century, buildings were built in the Colonial Revival styles with the principal body color painted white to mimic the appearance of early architecture. Bungalow buildings, which resulted from the Craftsman movement of the early 20th century, were generally maintained in earth tones with contrasting black or green shutters as accents. Painted metal roofing should be dark green or a dark red color (both were commonly used in the past).

Original paint colors for a building should be researched as a starting point. The book, *A Century of Color*, by Roger Moss, has color plates of similar types of houses to those found in Tipp City. Determine what combination of colors was used, in what locations and how many colors were used. It is always recommended that the first choice of paint color be a return to whatever the original color(s) were used. You can sometimes find out what the original color of your house by scraping away layers of paint with a utility or Exacto knife. The bottom layer may be the primer color and the layer on top of that, the original color. A layer of dirt between bare brick and the first paint layer indicate that the brick was not originally painted. Body, trim, shutters and doors may have been painted different colors, so you should check these areas as well. The paint may have faded over time, and one trick to give you a better idea of the original color is to brush the paint chip with olive oil. This will intensify the colors, approximating the original appearance. Most paints of the 19th and 20th centuries contained linseed oil, which has slowly evaporated, dulling the paint. The olive oil will substitute for the linseed oil in reviving

January 23, 2007

the original color on the chip.

If original colors will not be used, choose paint colors that are appropriate to the period and style of the building. For late 19th century buildings, contrasting colors may be appropriate, but avoid too many colors on one building. The simpler the building design, the fewer colors should be used. A conservative approach is to combine lighter and darker shades of the same color. On commercial buildings, the color selected for the storefront is usually repeated on the upper facade details such as friezes, cornices and window sash. A color appropriate as an accent or trim color may be entirely inappropriate on the body of a wall. Gloss black paint could be acceptable for the trim on an early 20th century building, for example, but would be prohibited on its siding.

In general, do not paint surfaces that have never been painted (e.g. foundations and steps). For example, stone surfaces were almost never painted (although brick often was during the 19th century). Painting stone can affect its texture and surface appearance, as well as lead to possible moisture problems by trapping moisture.

A Certificate of Appropriateness is not required to repaint existing painted surfaces with the same color. A certificate is required to change colors or to paint a previously unpainted surface. Color chips and diagrams showing the different building features to be painted in each color should be submitted with the application form. If colors have not yet been chosen, the Restoration Board can provide advice and suggestions.

#### Guidelines Booklet – Roof Replacement pp. 22-24

The roof not only serves to protect the house or building from the elements, it contributes significantly to the style and appearance of the structure. Variations in line, pitch and overhang can provide important clues to additions and modifications through the years. Roof types found in the Restoration District include gabled, Mansard, flat, Boomtown, and hip. While the majority of the roofs are asphalt shingle, some roofs still exist in or near the district with slate, imbricated slate, tile, standing seam metal and wood shingles.

Roofs should be inspected occasionally in order to identify problems early enough to avoid premature roof replacement or damage to the cornice or walls of the building. Look for curling or bulging shingles, rusted or leaking flashing, or in the case of slate or tile roofs, missing or misaligned slates or tiles. Examine gutters and downspouts and ensure that water runs off and away from the roof area. Leaves and twigs in the gutters can cause ice dams to form in the winter, causing damage to the gutters, the roof, and the eaves.

Examine slate roofs for deterioration. Some slate types have a life of 175 years or more! Often, problems here are with flashings or the slate hangers. Rusted hangers



January 23, 2007

can allow slate to slip causing leaks and damage. Re-hang the slate with new hangers. Replacing a slate roof can be expensive. In cases of extreme financial hardship it may be necessary to consider alternatives such as artificial slate, standing seam metal or asphalt shingles. Replacement color should match the color of the original slate as nearly as possible.

Metal surfaces should be kept painted (except for copper). Use an appropriate primer for the particular type of metal roof. Incompatible metal fasteners or flashing can cause galvanic corrosion. Patching a metal roof with roofing tar will accelerate the deterioration of the metal. A properly maintained metal roof will last about 70 years. Roof replacement, if necessary should be with similar standing-seam metal roofing.

As asphalt shingles age, they will loose their protective granular coating and will curl and buckle. Their typical life span is only about 20 to 30 years. Replacement of an asphalt shingle roof with asphalt shingles is acceptable. Generally, light-colored shingles are not acceptable, because they are a more modern development. If the original roof on the structure was metal, copper, slate or tile, consider restoring the roof to its original design and materials.

Historically, valley flashing was a typical treatment where the roof planes meet at different angles. Today it is common for roofers using asphalt shingles to weave the shingles at the valley. This can cause valleys to deteriorate more rapidly than those with a valley flashing. Copper, galvanized metal, and rolled aluminum with a baked-enamel finish are more appropriate choices for valley flashing than today's woven shingle technique. Baked enamel finishes are also preferred for gutters, downspouts, and flashings, rather than bare aluminum, zinc, or galvanized steel. Copper flashings and gutters should be kept bare, however.

A Certificate of Appropriateness is not required for a roof repair that uses the same materials and colors for the repair work. For any change in the type of material or color, a certificate is required. Roofing practices that change the appearance of the structure are strongly discouraged. These include the following:

1. Removing elements such as chimneys, skylights, light wells, dormers and cupolas that provide character to the building.
2. Adding antennae, satellite dishes (even those under 24" diameter), skylights, solar collectors and the like on the front of a building or street elevation. These items should be installed on non-historic accessory buildings or on non-character-defining areas of the roof that are not prominently visible from the streets.
3. Adding new elements such as vents, skylights or additional stories that would be visible from the primary elevations of the building.
4. Low-profile ridge vents are not acceptable if they detract from the original design and destroy historic roofing materials or design.
5. Applying paint or coatings to roofing materials that were not historically

January 23, 2007

coated, such as copper.

6. Replacing concealed or built-in gutters with exposed gutters.
7. Installation of new gutters and downspouts that detract from existing architectural features.
8. Replacement instead of repair of cornices, or the removal of elements such as brackets or blocks, which are part of the original composition, without replacing them with new ones of a like design.
9. Modification of the slope or structural design of a roof, such as conversion of a flat roof to a gable roof. (Such drastic modifications should only be conducted after thorough design work by a competent professional, with attention to the effect on the original style of the structure. In addition, such work usually requires a building permit and inspection of the new structural work and its support on the older structural members.)

Mr. Vath stated that if the Restoration Board approved the applicant's request, a Certificate of Appropriateness would be issued in accordance with code.

Board Members found the following: Three layers of the roof would need to be removed; new shingle had 110 mph wind protection; shingle was double thick; old roof vents would be removed and replaced with a ridge vent system; shingle type "Carriage House Shingle"; color of shingle "Colonial Slate"; existing aluminum window frames to be removed throughout; painting of the primary structure – main building to be "Ocean Storm" (gray); doors to remain red; trim to remain cream; sash to remain red; all other to remain cream.

Chairman Himes asked for further discussion. There being none, Mr. Blake **moved to approve the application as proposed**, seconded by Mrs. Wert. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Blake, Wert, Lohnes, Bagi, Gaster, and Himes. Nays: None.

#### **B. Annual Report**

Mr. Vath stated that Staff had prepared an annual report of the work of the Restoration Board for 2006 in accordance with Code §36.047(C) which states:

##### **§36.047 PLANNING PROCEDURES**

(C) The Restoration Board with the assistance of the Community and Economic Development Department and the Restoration Board Secretary shall prepare an annual report. A draft report shall be reviewed at the January meeting. A final report shall be prepared and provided to Council Members and the public for review.

Mr. Vath requested Restoration Board review of the report (text below), with formal adoption upon any additions or corrections.

#### **2006 ANNUAL REPORT**



**January 23, 2007**

1. A total of 21 requests for Certificates of Appropriateness were reviewed through December 2006. 21 requests were approved and/or approved with modifications, with zero (0) requests being denied.
2. On a monthly basis, copies of the Guidelines for the Old Tippecanoe City Restoration and Architectural District booklet were mailed to all new residents/tenants and business owners within the Historical District.
3. Board members finalized plans for, and initiated the promulgation of a Tipp City Historic Preservation Plan, through Tipp City's first Certified Local Government grant. Designated member(s) of the Board participated in a Steering Committee which guided the work of Benjamin D. Rickey & Co., consultants on the project. Work on the Preservation Plan preceded throughout the year, with a formal adoption of the Plan expected in early 2007.
4. Recommended code amendments regarding the modification of lot numbering within the Historic District.
5. A Community Development Block Grant Sign Reimbursement Program was adopted, whereby non-residential property owners within the Restoration District can apply for, and receive a seventy-five percent (75%) reimbursement for the purchase and installation of an exterior sign for a store front or other commercially oriented property. A selection of sign styles, colors and fonts were pre-approved by the Board in conjunction with the required approval from the Ohio Historic Preservation Office.
6. The Historic Preservation section of the Tipp City Public Library was enlarged, with the Restoration Board recommending the following books and periodicals for acquisition:
  - The Buildings of Main Street: A Guide to American Commercial Architecture
  - Traditional Construction Patterns: Design and Detail Rules-of-Thumb
  - The Houses We Live In: An Identification Guide to the History and Style of American Domestic Architecture
  - What Style Is It?: A Guide to American Architecture
  - The Economics of Historic Preservation: A Community Leaders Guide
  - Federal Historic Preservation Laws: The Official Compilation of U.S. Cultural Heritage Statutes
  - Renovation Old Houses: Bringing New Life to Vintage Homes
  - Repairing Old and Historic Windows: A Manual for Architects and Homeowners
  - Old House Journal – The Original Restoration Magazine
7. Application was made to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office for the acquisition of a Certified Local Government Grant for FY 2007. The proposed grant would be utilized for the development of educational programs to prepare and teach

January 23, 2007

Restoration Board members concerning the duties of the administration of the Historic District of Tipp City.

Board Members reviewed the 2006 Annual Report. Chairman Himes asked for further discussion. There being none, Mrs. Wert **moved to approve the 2006 Annual Report as written and to forward to City Council**, seconded by Mrs. Gaster. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Wert, Gaster, Himes, Bagi, Blake, and Lohnes. Nays: None.

### C. 2007 Annual Plan

Mr. Vath stated that Staff had prepared a draft annual plan outlining proposed priorities and activities for Restoration Board for 2007 in accordance with Code §36.047(B) which states:

#### § 36.047 PLANNING PROCEDURES

(B) The Restoration Board shall prepare an annual plan outlining its priorities and activities. A draft plan shall be written by Restoration Board members with assistance from the Community and Economic Development Department. The draft plan shall be submitted for review by the Restoration Board in November, and copies provided for Council and public review for 30 days. An approved plan shall be implemented effective January 1.

Mr. Vath also stated that accordingly, staff requested Restoration Board review of the annual plan (text below), with formal adoption upon any additions or corrections.

### 2007 ANNUAL PLAN

1. Distribute a copy of the Guidelines for the Old Tippecanoe City Restoration and Architectural District Booklet to all existing residents within the Historical District. Also distribute the Guidelines Booklet to all new residents/tenants and business owners within the Historical District as needed.
2. Review City Code as it pertains to the Restoration Board and make recommendations for changes/updates as necessary, including the underlying zoning districts.
3. In association with a FY 2006 Certified Local Government grant, provide assistance to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office and City consultant firm Benjamin D. Rickey & Co. regarding the promulgation and adoption of the Tipp City Historic Preservation Plan.
4. In association with a FY 2007 Certified Local Government grant, provide assistance to the Ohio Historic Preservation Office and City consultant firm (to be selected in early 2007) regarding the development of educational programs to prepare and teach Restoration Board members, other Board members, and the public at large concerning the duties of the administration of the Historic District of Tipp City.



**January 23, 2007**

5. Continue to upgrade the section at the library pertaining to Restoration and Preservation.
6. Review photograph file and update as necessary to include photos be taken by July 1, 2007, by Board Members working in conjunction with Staff to complete and notify property owners.
7. Review physical limits of the R/A district when property owners request addition to district.
8. Update Guidelines for the Old Tippecanoe City Restoration and Architectural District Booklet for printing and distribution in 2008.
9. In accordance with the "Legacy District Reuse Plan," discuss and pursue Historic Property designations for Saunders Seed, S&G Painting, Dolly Toy Warehouse and original Dolly Toy building.
10. Replace Historic District signage at entrances to district with sand blasted wood signs.
  - a. 2007 – All remaining side street signs within the Historic District

Board Members found that the budget for the library was approximately four hundred Dollars. Mr. Vath stated that an estimated three hundred dollars was spent the previous year. It was found that the last photo inventory was performed several years ago and needed to be a priority for 2007. Mr. Vath stated that a list of properties within the district could be provided. Board Members agreed to acquire digital photographs to be completed by July 1, 2007.

Board Members briefly discussed posting the photos on the website. It was agreed to

It was also mentioned that after a Certificate of Appropriateness was issued, Staff should follow up to confirm completion.

Mr. Blake inquired as to how many residents outside the Restoration District had requested to change their property zoning to be included in the district. Mr. Vath stated that only one resident has voiced such a desire, but the property was not contiguous with the district. Mr. Vath also stated that the city's consultant, Benjamin D. Ricky, had suggested as part of the Historic Preservation Plan to look at other properties and to potentially add them to the National Historic Registry.

Brief discussion took place regarding the posting of the photo index to the website. It was agreed to not pursue the posting at this time. It was expressed that some individuals would feel that posting properties on the website would not be appropriate.

January 23, 2007

Board Members agreed to modify number six of the annual plan to include a deadline of completion.

Mr. Blake moved that the Board update the 2007 Annual Plan number six to include that the photographic inventory be taken by July 1, 2007, by the Board Members working in conjunction with Staff to notify property owners that the Board would be updating the photo index, seconded by Mrs. Wert. **Motion carried.** Ayes: Blake, Wert, Lohnes, Bagi, Gaster, and Himes.

#### Old Business

There was none.

#### Miscellaneous

- Preservation Brief

Mr. Vath stated that the Historic Preservation Plan meeting was scheduled for Monday, February 5, 2007, at 6:00 p.m. at the Zion Lutheran Church. Mr. Vath also stated that the consultants from Benjamin D. Rickey & Co. would be present. Restoration Board Members were encouraged to attend.

Mr. Blake stated that he was excited to be working with the members and that it was great to be back on the Restoration Board, and that the members have all done a fantastic job over the past couple of years.

#### Adjournment

Chairman Himes asked for further discussion or comments. There being none, Mrs. Wert moved for adjournment, seconded by Mr. Bagi and unanimously approved. Meeting adjourned at 8:24 p.m.

ATTEST: Kimberly Patterson  
Mrs. Kimberly Patterson - Board Secretary

APPROVED: Robert D. Himes  
Chairman Robert Himes